

# MINUTES

## PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION

Two Piedmont Avenue

Atlanta, Georgia

January 9, 2014

The Georgia Professional Standards Commission (PSC) met on Thursday, January 9, 2014, at 12:30 p.m.

### Members Present

Julia Bernath

Lauren Eckman

Dr. Penny Elkins

Dr. Adrian Epps

David Johnson

Scott Justus

Kamila Luigs

Christy McGill

Terrie Ponder

Carol Rivera

Sheryl Stalvey

Dr. Lawrence Walters

Pam Walker

Pam Williams

### Members Absent

Valerie Mateen

Heath Garrett

Bettina Polite Tate

Phil Jacobs

## **I. WORK SESSION**

The entire work session was devoted to the rules. Anne Marie Fenton gave a brief introduction on the rules to preview. Kelli Young presented the Certification rules and then answered questions from the Commissioners. She gave all Commissioners a hand-out that detailed the many changes.

Both Kelly Henson and Dr. Penny Elkins recognized Kelli Young and her staff for the many hours that they have spent on these rules. They both thanked her and her staff for all of their work on this complex material. David Hill will present the Educator Preparation rules in the Commission meeting.

## **II. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Elkins called the meeting to order at 12:45 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance to the U.S. flag and a moment of silence.

## **III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Chair Dr. Elkins called for approval of the agenda.

**MOTION:** (Kami Luigs / Dr. Adrian Epps) To amend the agenda to reflect the continuation of Rules to Preview followed by the Educator Preparation/Certification report.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

## **IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Chair Elkins called for approval of the minutes from the December 12, 2013, Commission meeting.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

**V. VISITORS**

Chair Dr. Elkins welcomed the visitors.

- Jessica Johnson, Office of Planning and Budget
- John Hooper, Georgia School Superintendents Association
- Linda Fortson, Warren Fortson Law Office
- Tayia Donald, Georgia Association of Educators (GAE)

**VI. RULES TO PREVIEW**

Dr. David Hill presented the Educator Preparation rules to preview and then answered questions from the Commissioners. Dr. Hill also handed out a packet to the Commissioners with rule revisions.

Dr. Hill also thanked the certification staff for their many hours of work on the rules.

**VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**A. Educator Preparation/Certification Standing Committee**

Committee Chair, Dr. Adrian Epps, presented the report of the Educator Preparation Standing Committee.

	EPP Number	January 2014 Detailed Approval Recommendations
1.	Dalton State College	For EPP 10018, the Committee recommends Continuing Approval of the Educator Preparation Provider and five Educator Preparation Programs including, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• English Education Program (6-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• History Education Program (6-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Mathematics Education Program (6-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Science Education Program- Biology (6-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Science Education Program- Chemistry (6-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> </ul>
2.	Georgia Southern University	For EPP 5390, the Committee recommends Developmental Approval of one Educator Preparation Program, and Continuing Approval of fifty-four Educator Preparation Programs including, and <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Curriculum and Instruction-Accomplished Teaching (P-12; I Master's)</li> <li>• Biology Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Biology Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Broad Field Science Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certif</li> <li>• Broad Field Science Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T</li> <li>• Business Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Business Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Chemistry Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification or</li> <li>• Chemistry Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Early Childhood Education Program (P-5; Initial; Certificatic</li> </ul>

EPP Number	January 2014 Detailed Approval Recommendations
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Early Childhood Education Program (P-5; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Economics Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Economics Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Educational Leadership Program (Building and System Level Certification only)</li> <li>• Educational Leadership Program (Building and System Level Specialist)</li> <li>• English Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• English Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• ESOL Endorsement</li> <li>• Family and Consumer Sciences (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Family and Consumer Sciences (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Foreign Language Education Program (P-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Foreign Language Education Program (P-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Geography Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Geography Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Health and Physical Education Program (P-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Health and Physical Education Program (P-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• History Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• History Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Instructional Technology (P-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Instructional Technology (P-12; Initial; Master's)</li> <li>• Instructional Technology (P-12; Initial; Ed Specialist)</li> <li>• K-5 Mathematics Endorsement</li> <li>• Mathematics Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Mathematics Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Media Specialist Program (P-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Media Specialist Program (P-12; Initial; Master's)</li> <li>• Middle Grades Education (4-8; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Middle Grades Education (4-8; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Middle Grades Education (4-8; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Music Education (P-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Online Teaching and Learning Endorsement</li> <li>• Physics Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Physics Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Political Science Education Program (6-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Political Science Education Program (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> </ul>

	EPP Number	January 2014 Detailed Approval Recommendations
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reading Specialist Education Program (P-12; Initial; Master</li> <li>• Reading Endorsement</li> <li>• School Counselor (P-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• School Counselor (P-12; Initial; Master’s)</li> <li>• School Psychologist (P-12; Initial; Ed Specialist)</li> <li>• Special Education General Curriculum (P-12; Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Special Education General Curriculum (P-12; Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> <li>• Special Education General Curriculum (P-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Special Education General Curriculum/Early Childhood Edu Initial; Certification only)</li> <li>• Special Education General Curriculum/Early Childhood Edu Initial; Baccalaureate)</li> </ul>
3.	University of West Georgia	<p>For EPP 5540, the Committee recommends Continuing Approval of twenty-four Educator Preparation Programs including,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Art (P-12; Initial; B.F.A .and Certification Only)</li> <li>• Biology (6-12; Initial; B.S. and M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Broad Field Science (6-12; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Business Education (6-12; Initial; MAT)</li> <li>• Chemistry (6-12; Initial; B.A. and M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Early Childhood Education (P-5; Initial; B.S .and Certification Only)</li> <li>• Earth/Space Science (6-12; Initial; B.S. and M.A.T)</li> <li>• Economics (6-12; Initial; B.S. and M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Educational Leadership (Performance-based PL6; P-12; Initial; Ed.S. and Certification Only)</li> <li>• English (6-12; Initial; B.A. and M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Foreign Language: French (P-12; Initial; B.A. and Certification Only)</li> <li>• Foreign Language: Spanish (P-12; Initial; B.A. and Certification Only)</li> <li>• Health and Physical Education (P-12; Initial; B.S.)</li> <li>• History (6-12; Initial; B.A. and M.A.T )</li> <li>• Mathematics (6-12; Initial; B.S. and M.A.T)</li> <li>• Online: Media Specialist (P-12; Initial; M.Ed. and Certification Only)</li> <li>• Music (P-12; Initial; B.M. and Certification Only)</li> <li>• Mathematics (6-12; Initial; B.S. and M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Physics (6-12; Initial; B.S. and M.A.T.)</li> <li>• Political Science (6-12; Initial; M.A.T.)</li> <li>• School Counselor (P-12; Initial; M.Ed.)</li> </ul>

	EPP Number	January 2014 Detailed Approval Recommendations
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Online Special Education General Curriculum (P-12; Initial; B.S.)</li> <li>• Special Education General Curriculum Online (P-12; Initial; M.Ed.)</li> <li>• Speech and Language Pathology (Initial; M.Ed.)</li> </ul>
4.	College of Coastal Georgia	For EPP 10148, the Progress Report submitted September 11, 2013, is satisfactory in addressing areas for improvement for Standard 4 (element b) for the Educator Preparation Provider resulting from the Spring 2012 Developmental Review. The Committee recommends all areas for improvement may be removed.
5.	University of North Georgia	For EPP 98255, the Progress Report submitted September 12, 2013, is satisfactory in addressing areas for improvement for Standard 4 (element b) for all M.A.T. and Certification-only programs, and Standard 4 (element d) for all initial preparation programs resulting from the Spring 2013 Continuing Review. The Committee recommends all areas for improvement be removed.
6.	Valdosta State University	<p>For EPP 5070, the Progress Report submitted November 1, 2013, is satisfactory in addressing areas for improvement for Standard 4 (element c) for the following programs resulting from the Fall 2011 Initial Performance Review:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educational Leadership Program (P-12; Initial; M.Ed.)</li> <li>• Educational Leadership Program (P-12; Initial; Certification- only; PL6 &amp; PL7)</li> <li>• Educational Leadership Program- Performance Based (P-12; Initial; Ed.S.; PL6)</li> <li>• Educational Leadership Program- Performance Based (P-12; Initial; Ed.D.; PL6 &amp; PL7)</li> </ul> <p>The Committee recommends all areas for improvement be removed.</p>
7.	Educator Certificate #649190 Tier II Appeal	<p>For the Tier II Appeal for Educator Certificate #649190 who completed a Master’s degree in Early Childhood Education (ECE) expecting to be certified in this field, this degree does not lead to certification. Consequently the educator cannot be certified in Early Childhood Education. The Committee recommends that a level upgrade be granted to the educator for level 5, but not grant certification in ECE since the start of the program was so close to the beginning grandfathering date; and the program was completed, in spring 2013, well before the ending date for grandfathering.</p> <p>Additionally, the Committee recommends the Educator Preparation Provider respond to the case of Educator Certificate # 649190 by presenting a letter to the Commission including the following information:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. An explanation of how the candidate in question who was seeking certification in a field was admitted to a program that did not lead to certification;</li> <li>2. A determination of whether or not there were other students also impacted by this admissions error; and</li> <li>3. The University’s plan to assure this occurrence does not happen again in the future.</li> </ol>

Chair Elkins called for approval of the Educator Preparation/Certification Committee report as presented by Dr. Adrian Epps.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Abstention: Dr. Adrian Epps – College of Coastal Georgia, Terrie Ponder – University of West Georgia

**B. Ethics and Professional Conduct --Recommendations and Actions on Cases**

Chair Pam Walker of the Educator Ethics Review Committee (EERC), gave a preliminary review of the Cases.

1. Ms. Walker reported that the Committee reviewed 40 *Probable Cause* cases during its January 9, 2014, meeting and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

<u>CASE</u>	<u>STANDARDS VIOLATED</u>	<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>
13-9-181	1, 4, 9	Deny
13-10-252	1	Reprimand
13-10-282	1	Reprimand
13-10-286	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-11-303	1	Deny
13-11-311	1	Reprimand
13-11-321	10	Reprimand
13-11-323	1	Deny
13-11-324	5(a)(2), 5(a)(5)	Reprimand
12-3-974	2, 10	Suspension - 1 year
12-7-012	1	Revocation
12-7-048	10	Revocation
12-7-155	1	Revocation
12-11-518	10	Suspension - 20 days
12-11-529	2,7,10	Suspension - 1 year
12-12-606	1, 10	Revocation
13-1-650	2, 10	Revocation
13-1-704	3, 10	Suspension - 1 year
13-2-732	1	Revocation
13-2-798	1,4,9	Revocation
13-4-996	4, 10	Suspension - 10 days
13-4-1013	10	Reprimand
13-5-1056	1,4,9	Revocation
13-6-1265	1,10	Revocation
13-7-19	2, 10	Revocation
13-7-30	1	Reprimand
13-7-38	4, 10	Suspension - 20 days
13-7-46	4,5,10	Revocation
13-8-69	3,10	Suspension - 1 year
13-9-147	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-9-206	4,9	Revocation
13-10-246	4,10	Suspension - 2 years
13-10-251	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-10-254	2, 3, 10	Reprimand
13-10-266	9,10	Suspension - 90 days

<u>CASE</u>	<u>STANDARDS VIOLATED</u>	<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>
13-10-290	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-10-291	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-10-292	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-10-293	1,4,9	Reprimand
13-11-297	1,4,9	Reprimand

2. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 1 *Petitions Issue* and brought the following recommendation on behalf of the Committee:

<u>CASE</u>	<u>PREVIOUS SANCTION</u>	<u>EERC RECOMMENDATION</u>
13-9-223	Denial - April 8, 2010	Deny

3. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 17 *Settlement Agreements* and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

<u>CASE</u>	<u>SANCTION</u>	<u>EERC RECOMMENDATION</u>
11-9-396	Suspension - 2 years	Accept
12-4-1141	Reprimand	Accept
12-12-597	Reprimand	Accept
13-2-755	Suspension - 1 year	Accept
13-4-927	Suspension - 1 year	Accept
13-5-1046	Revocation	Accept
13-5-1104	Suspension - 20 days	Accept
13-6-1149	Reprimand	Accept
13-6-1193	Suspension - 1 year	Accept
13-8-91	Reprimand	Accept
13-8-120	Reprimand	Accept
13-8-132	Suspension - 90 days	Accept
13-8-136	Suspension - 1 year	Accept
13-9-144	Suspension - 90 days	Accept
13-9-177	Denial	Accept
13-9-225	Reprimand	Accept
13-11-331	Reprimand	Accept

4. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 12 *Negotiated Settlement Agreements* and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

<u>CASE</u>	<u>NEGOTIATED SANCTION</u>	<u>EERC RECOMMENDATION</u>
11-5-1176	Suspension - 2 years	Accept
11-9-342	Suspension - 40 days	Accept
12-1-737	NPC	Accept
12-4-1150	Suspension - 5 days	Accept
12-7-171	Suspension - 40 days	Accept
12-7-172	Suspension - 40 days	Accept
12-7-191	Suspension - 1 yr 8 mos	Accept
13-1-689	Suspension - 1 year	Accept
13-3-842	Reprimand	Accept
13-5-1069	NPC	Accept
13-5-1111	NPC	Accept
13-6-1203	Suspension - 1 year	Accept

#### 6. OTHER BUSINESS

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the *Other Business Report* as follows:

<u>CASE</u>	<u>SANCTION</u>	<u>EERC RECOMMENDATION</u>
PCE 11-9-304	Close case - Hold New App	Close case - Hold New App
VS 13-9-220	Voluntary Surrender	Accept
PCE 13-9-182 thru 186	NPC	NPC
PCE 13-4-999	Grant	Grant

7. The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the *Preliminary Investigative Determination Report* consisting of 53 new complaints received during the months of December 2013 and January 2014.

#### 8. VOLUNTARY SURRENDERS

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the 3 Voluntary Surrenders listed below in which an Educator/Applicant voluntarily accepted a sanction of Revocation or Denial prior to the submission of an investigative case summary for a Probable Cause Determination.

<u>CASE</u>	<u>STANDARDS VIOLATED</u>	<u>SANCTION</u>	<u>EERC RECOMMENDATION</u>
13-10-245	2, 10	Voluntary Surrender	Accept
13-10-277	1, 2, 10	Voluntary Surrender	Accept

13-11-368	2, 3, 10	Voluntary Surrender	Accept
-----------	----------	---------------------	--------

### 9. **EXTENSIONS – PRELIMINARY INVESTIGATIVE DETERMINATIONS**

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the 18 Extensions - Preliminary Investigative Determinations consisting of the following:

14-1-441	14-1-444	14-1-447	14-1-450	14-1-453	14-1-456
14-1-442	14-1-445	14-1-448	14-1-451	14-1-454	14-1-457
14-1-443	14-1-446	14-1-449	14-1-452	14-1-455	14-1-458

### 10. **EXTENSIONS - INVESTIGATIONS**

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended granting and *Investigative Extension* to the following 176 cases:

<b>WRITTEN COMPLAINT EXTENSIONS</b>							
10-9-331	11-9-458	12-11-505	13-1-663	13-3-859	13-5-1076	13-6-1241	13-9-194
10-12-553	11-9-458	12-11-516	13-1-679	13-3-861	13-5-1080	13-6-1243	13-9-210
10-12-562	11-11-600	12-11-530	13-1-691	13-3-865	13-5-1087	13-6-1244	13-9-217
11-8-119	11-12-702	12-11-531	13-1-696	13-3-869	13-5-1112	13-6-1247	13-9-221
11-8-130	11-12-710	12-11-552	13-1-719	13-3-878	13-6-1162	13-6-1249	13-9-222
11-8-200	12-2-891	12-11-555	13-2-721	13-3-891	13-6-1168	13-7-11	13-9-229
11-9-284	12-2-896	12-12-561	13-2-723	13-3-894	13-6-1176	13-7-15	13-10-239
11-9-337	12-2-901	12-12-565	13-2-725	13-3-904	13-6-1178	13-7-20	13-10-240
11-9-343	12-3-1026	12-12-567	13-2-756	13-3-905	13-6-1184	13-7-21	13-10-244
11-9-355	12-4-1120	12-12-590	13-2-757	13-3-907	13-6-1195	13-7-23	13-10-245
11-9-392	12-4-1133	12-12-592	13-2-759	13-3-917	13-6-1199	13-7-36	13-10-255
11-9-398	12-4-1137	12-12-594	13-2-778	13-4-937	13-6-1202	13-7-39	13-10-258
11-9-399	12-4-1140	12-12-595	13-2-780	13-4-953	13-6-1207	13-7-40	13-10-259
11-9-402	12-7-72	12-12-600	13-2-786	13-4-982	13-6-1209	13-7-54	13-10-273
11-9-418	12-7-81	12-12-607	13-2-787	13-4-983	13-6-1210	13-8-56	13-10-276
11-9-419	12-7-111	13-1-633	13-2-788	13-4-987	13-6-1226	13-8-123	13-10-278
11-9-420	12-7-112	13-1-634	13-2-789	13-4-1007	13-6-1229	13-8-133	13-10-279
11-9-421	12-8-263	13-1-639	13-2-801	13-4-1016	13-6-1230	13-9-142	13-10-282
11-9-424	12-8-264	13-1-640	13-3-832	13-4-1028	13-6-1231	13-9-143	13-10-284
11-9-455	12-9-336	13-1-643	13-3-838	13-5-1032	13-6-1234	13-9-180	13-10-287
11-9-456	12-9-346	13-1-646	13-3-841	13-5-1043	13-6-1239	13-9-192	13-10-288
11-9-457	12-10-480	13-1-655	13-3-854	13-5-1049	13-6-1240	13-9-193	13-10-294

### 11. **APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATION REPORT**

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended to approve a no probable cause determination on 4 cases reflected on the *Applications for Certification Report*.

### 12. **FINAL DECISIONS**

The Commission reviewed the *Final Decision Report* concerning 3 cases.

<u>CASE</u>	<u>ORIGINAL SANCTION</u>	<u>ALJ SANCTION</u>	<u>EERC RECOMMENDATION</u>
12-7-204	Suspension 2 years	NPC	Accept
12-7-205	Suspension 2 years	Suspension 30 days	Accept
13-4-968	Reprimand	Reprimand	Accept

#### 14. **FINAL DECISIONS BY OPERATION OF LAW**

The Commission reviewed the report, which advised of 16 cases now closed without an appeal for a hearing before an Administrative Law Judge. The report also advised that there were 2 cases closed without an appeal for a review hearing before the Commission.

Chair Elkins called for approval of the Educator Ethics Review Committee report as presented by Pam Walker excluding case #'s 13-10-246, 13-10-254 and 12-3-974.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Abstention: David Johnson – Case # 13-12-395, Dr. Lawrence Walters – Case #'s 13-5-1111, 13-12-427, Julia Bernath – Case #'s 13-12-376, 13-12-397, 13-12-398, 13-12-399, 13-12-400, 13-12-401, 13-12-402, 13-12-403, 13-12-404, 13-12-405, Pam Williams – Case # 11-9-342, Kami Luigs - Case #13-12-374, 13-12-378

#### **Probable Cause Case # 12-3-974**

**MOTION:** (Dr. Adrian Epps / Pam Williams) To accept the Educator Ethics Review Committee's recommendation for a 1 year Suspension.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Opposed: Julia Bernath

#### **Probable Cause Case # 13-10-246**

**MOTION:** (Dr. Adrian Epps / Pam Williams) To accept the Educator Ethics Review Committee's recommendation for a 2 year Suspension.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Opposed: Julia Bernath, Christy McGill, Kami Luigs

#### **Probable Cause Case # 13-10-254**

**MOTION:** (Pam Walker / Pam Williams) To accept the Educator Ethics Review Committee's recommendation for a Reprimand.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Opposed: Julia Bernath, Christy McGill, Dr. Adrian Epps, David Johnson, Dr. Larry Walters, Terrie Ponder

### **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Dr. Elkins called for the meeting to be adjourned at 1:55 p.m.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved