#### **MINUTES**

## PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION

# Two Piedmont Avenue Atlanta, Georgia

April 11, 2013

The Georgia Professional Standards Commission (PSC) met on Thursday, April 11, 2013, at 12:30 p.m.

## **Members Present**

Julia BernathDavid JohnsonBettina Polite TateAlice ClementsKamila LuigsDr. Lawrence Walters

Dr. Adrian Epps Christy McGill Pam Walker
Phil Jacobs Sheryl Stalvey Pam Williams
Valerie Williams

**Members Absent** 

Bill Haskin Dr. Penny Elkins Heath Garrett Scott Justus

Stephanie Leggett

#### I. WORK SESSION

Kelly spoke briefly about the transition plan for reporting unsatisfactory performance to the PSC. The passage of House Bill 244 alters the evaluation of educators in Georgia. The changes, which do not take effect until the school year 2013 -2015 create two evaluation schemes: 1) For teachers of record, prinicipals, and assistant principals, the evaluation system will yield four explicit ratings (exemplary, proficient, needs development and ineffective). The last two must be reported to PSC once the system is in place statewide. 2) For all other certificated personnel, the evaluation system will continue to yield an explicit rating of unsatisfactory and at least one other rating positive rating. The unsatisfactory rating is to be reported to PSC. A hand-out was provided to Commissioners which addressed what districts should do now and in school year 2013-2014 and what happens in school year 2-14-2015.

Kelly Henson and Kristina Stroede provided an update on the following bills: HBs 105, 106, 123, 173, 211, 244, 245, 283, 327, and 354, as well as SBs 101, 160, and 167.

Kelly Henson provided an update on CAEP/Proposed Standards. A hand-out was proved to Commissioners with the four leverage points, important Georgia connections, annual reporting and timeline. The Commissioners were also given a DRAFT-Recommendation for the CAEP Board and a letter from Angela Coleman , Board of Regents, University System of Georgia providing the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education with the Board of Regents comments on the recommendations. Dr. Adrian Epps also commented on some of the issues that Angela Coleman addressed in her letter.

Julia Bernath thanked the Commission for allowing her to Chair the meeting and congratulated Phil Jacobs on the birth of his new grandaughter, Margaret.

#### II. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Bernath called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance to the U.S. flag and a

moment of silence.

#### III. **ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Vice Chair Bernath called for approval of the agenda.

**MOTION:** (Dr. Adrian Epps / Pam Walker) To approve the agenda.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

#### IV. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Vice Chair Bernath called for approval of the minutes from the March 13, 2013, Commission meeting.

**PSC ACTION**: Approved

#### V. **VISITORS**

Vice Chair Bernath welcomed the visitors.

- Margaret Elliott, Professional Association of Georgia Linda Fortson, Warren Fortson Law Office Educators
- Stan Baker, Jordan Law Firm

- Tayia Donald, Georgia Association of Educators (GAE)

#### VI. EMPLOYEE SERVICE AWARDS

Julia Bernath presented David Pumphrey with a 5 Year Service Award and Kelly read the following:

When David joined the PSC's Ethics Division he brought with him a wealth of experience and training. David's background in law enforcement includes positions at both the local and federal levels.

David Pumphrey has been employed by the PSC twice. We are now celebrating his combined employment that equals five years!

David was with us from December 1, 2004 until September 16, 2006. David left the PSC to test his wings in the world of sales and marketing. Although he did well in sales, he realized that his true calling was conducting investigations. David left the PSC in good standing and with an excellent reputation. He applied for an open investigator position and was rehired on December 9, 2009. David picked up right where he left off. He has distinguished his self as a competent and thorough investigator. David has done a fine job since he has returned to the PSC and we look forward to long lasting working relationship between David and the PSC.

Congratulations David and thank you.

#### VII. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

## A. Ethics and Professional Conduct -- Recommendations and Actions on Cases

Vice Chair Bernath of the Educator Ethics Review Committee (EERC), gave a preliminary review of the Cases.

1. Ms. Walker reported that the Committee reviewed 38 *Probable Cause* cases during its April 11, 2013, meeting and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

| CASE      | <u>STANDARDS</u> | RECOMMENDATION     |  |
|-----------|------------------|--------------------|--|
|           | VIOLATED         |                    |  |
| 12-10-475 | 1                | 1                  |  |
| 12-11-512 | 1, 4, 9          | 1, 4, 9            |  |
| 13-1-664  | 10               | 10                 |  |
| 11-2-734  | 1, 10            | NPC                |  |
| 11-7-097  | 2, 4, 10         | Revoke             |  |
| 11-9-391  | 4,7,9,10,DOE     | Suspension 2 years |  |
| 12-1-738  | 2, 10            | Suspension 5 days  |  |
| 12-2-827  | 1,3,4,10         | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-2-856  | 2 & 10           | Suspension 20 days |  |
| 12-3-1044 | 2, 10            | Revoke             |  |
| 12-3-1049 | 2 & 10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-4-1144 | 10 & 11          | Suspension 2 years |  |
| 12-4-1147 | 8, 10            | Suspension 90 days |  |
| 12-4-1151 | 3 & 10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-5-1183 | 1, 4, 9          | Reprimand          |  |
| 12-5-1237 | 4,10             | NPC                |  |
| 12-5-1278 | 1, 9, 10         | Suspension 2 years |  |
| 12-6-1289 | 2,10             | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-6-1295 | 10, 11           | Suspension 2 years |  |
| 12-6-1333 | 2, 10            | Suspension 90 days |  |
| 12-7-0011 | 1, 9, 10         | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-7-144  | 10               | Revoke             |  |
| 12-8-266  | 10,11            | NPC                |  |
| 12-9-382  | 3,10             | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-9-383  | 2 & 10           | Suspension 5 days  |  |
| 12-10-429 | 3, 10            | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-10-433 | 3 & 10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-11-508 | 2,10             | Reprimand          |  |
| 12-11-549 | 2 & 10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-12-566 | 5,10             | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 12-12-578 | 1, 9, 10         | Revoke             |  |
| 12-12-627 | 1, 4, 9          | Reprimand          |  |
| 12-12-631 | 3,10             | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 13-1-687  | 8,10             | Suspension 90 days |  |
| 13-1-705  | 4,5,10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 13-1-706  | 4,5,10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |
| 13-1-707  | 4,5,10           | Suspension 1 year  |  |

| CASE     | STANDARDS<br>VIOLATED | RECOMMENDATION    |
|----------|-----------------------|-------------------|
| 13-1-708 | 4,5,10                | Suspension 1 year |
|          |                       |                   |

2. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 1 *Initial Decision* and brought the following recommendation on behalf of the Committee:

| CASE         | Original<br>Sanction | Proposed<br>Sanction | Decision of the ALJ and the Rationale for the Decision       |
|--------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|
| 12-2-<br>915 | Susp 2<br>years      | Susp 2 years         | Original Sanction (Suspension: May 6, 2013 thru May 6, 2015) |

3. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 3 *Petitions Issues* and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

| CASE     | PREVIOUS<br>SANCTION     | EERC RECOMMENDATIONS |
|----------|--------------------------|----------------------|
| 13-3-750 | Denial 01/23/2009        | Deny                 |
| 13-2-768 | Denial 05/05/2007        | Deny                 |
| 13-2-819 | Revocation<br>12/19/2008 | Deny                 |

4. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 10 *Settlement Agreements* and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

| CASE      | <u>SANCTION</u>      | EERC RECOMMENDATIONS |
|-----------|----------------------|----------------------|
| 11-7-87   | Suspension - 90 days | Accept               |
| 12-1-725  | Suspension - 1 year  | Accept               |
| 12-7-65   | Reprimand            | Accept               |
| 12-9-376  | Warning              | Accept               |
| 12-10-393 | Reprimand            | Accept               |
| 12-10-451 | Reprimand            | Accept               |
| 12-10-468 | Reprimand            | Accept               |
| 12-11-491 | Reprimand            | Accept               |
| 12-11-498 | Reprimand            | Accept               |
| 12-11-559 | Suspension - 90 days | Accept               |

5. Ms. Walker reported that the Educator Ethics Review Committee reviewed 14 *Negotiated Settlement Agreements* and brought the following recommendations on behalf of the Committee:

| CASE      | NEGOTIATED SANCTION | EERC RECOMMENDATIONS |
|-----------|---------------------|----------------------|
| 11-1-702  | Susp 1 year         | Accept               |
| 11-3-876  | Reprimand           | Accept               |
| 11-5-1123 | Warning             | Accept               |
| 11-8-225  | Susp 60 days        | Accept               |
| 11-10-480 | Susp 10 days        | Accept               |
| 11-10-511 | Susp 1 year         | Accept               |
| 12-1-800  | Reprimand           | Accept               |
| 12-3-964  | Susp 1 year         | Accept               |
| 12-3-1060 | Reprimand           | Accept               |
| 12-5-1253 | Susp 60 days        | Accept               |
| 12-8-281  | Reprimand           | Accept               |
| 12-8-300  | Susp 142 days       | Accept               |
| 12-8-310  | Reprimand           | Accept               |
| 12-9-335  | Susp 132 days       | Accept               |

#### 6. OTHER BUSINESS

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the *Other Business Report* as follows:

| CASE     | CASE Findings of Fact from the Original Case EERC RECOMMENDATION |                      |
|----------|--|----------------------|
| 13-2-747 | Expand current investigation                                     | Expand investigation |

7. The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the *Preliminary Investigative Determination Report* consisting of 78 new complaints received during the months of March and April 2013.

## 8. **VOLUNTARY SURRENDERA**

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the 4 Voluntary Surrenders listed below in which an Educator/Applicant voluntarily accepted a sanction of Revocation or Denial prior to the submission of an investigative case summary for a Probable Cause Determination.

| CASE      | STANDARDS<br>VIOLATED | <u>SANCTION</u>     |
|-----------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| 12-3-1019 | 2, 10                 | Voluntary Surrender |
| 13-1-645  | 1, 2, 10              | Voluntary Surrender |
| 13-2-738  | 4, 5, 10              | Voluntary Surrender |
| 13-2-770  | 1, 2, 10              | Voluntary Surrender |

#### 9. EXTENSIONS – PRELIMINARY INVESTIGATIVE DETERMINATIONS

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended approval of the 50 Extensions - Preliminary Investigative Determinations consisting of the following:

5/22/2013 Page 6

| 13-3-905 | 13-3-912 | 13-3-920 | 13-4-927 | 13-4-934 | 13-4-941 | 13-4-952 | 13-4-962 |
|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| 13-3-906 | 13-3-913 | 13-3-921 | 13-4-928 | 13-4-935 | 13-4-942 | 13-4-953 |          |
| 13-3-907 | 13-3-915 | 13-4-922 | 13-4-929 | 13-4-936 | 13-4-943 | 13-4-955 |          |
| 13-3-908 | 13-3-916 | 13-4-923 | 13-4-930 | 13-4-937 | 13-4-944 | 13-4-956 |          |
| 13-3-909 | 13-3-917 | 13-4-924 | 13-4-931 | 13-4-938 | 13-4-947 | 13-4-957 |          |
| 13-3-910 | 13-3-918 | 13-4-925 | 13-4-932 | 13-4-939 | 134-948  | 13-4-958 |          |
| 13-3-911 | 13-3-919 | 13-4-926 | 13-4-933 | 13-4-940 | 13-4-951 | 13-4-960 |          |
|          |          |          |          |          |          |          |          |

10. <u>EXTENSIONS - INVESTIGATIONS</u>
The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended granting and *Investigative Extension* to the following 248 cases:

|           | 248 cases:  WRITTEN COMPLAINT EXTENSIONS |           |          |           |           |           |           |
|-----------|--|-----------|----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| 10-9-331  | 11-9-456                                 | 12-4-1133 | 12-7-72  | 12-8-260  | 12-10-477 | 12-11-552 | 12-12-617 |
| 10-12-553 | 11-9-457                                 | 12-4-1137 | 12-7-74  | 12-8-261  | 12-10-478 | 12-11-554 | 12-12-621 |
| 10-12-562 | 11-9-458                                 | 12-4-1140 | 12-7-75  | 12-8-263  | 12-10-480 | 12-11-555 | 12-12-622 |
| 11-6-1192 | 11-9-459                                 | 12-4-1141 | 12-7-76  | 12-8-264  | 12-10-482 | 12-11-556 | 12-12-623 |
| 11-6-1227 | 11-11-561                                | 12-4-1150 | 12-7-77  | 12-8-267  | 12-11-487 | 12-11-557 | 12-12-626 |
| 11-8-119  | 11-11-589                                | 12-4-1159 | 12-7-79  | 12-8-269  | 12-11-493 | 12-12-561 | 12-12-628 |
| 11-8-130  | 11-11-598                                | 12-5-1203 | 12-7-80  | 12-8-278  | 12-11-503 | 12-12-565 | 13-1-633  |
| 11-8-142  | 11-11-600                                | 12-5-1210 | 12-7-81  | 12-8-294  | 12-11-505 | 12-12-567 | 13-1-634  |
| 11-8-200  | 11-11-603                                | 12-5-1216 | 12-7-86  | 12-8-296  | 12-11-507 | 12-12-570 | 13-1-635  |
| 11-9-284  | 11-12-702                                | 12-5-1232 | 12-7-89  | 12-8-299  | 12-11-510 | 12-12-573 | 13-1-637  |
| 11-9-298  | 11-12-710                                | 12-5-1241 | 12-7-96  | 12-8-302  | 12-11-514 | 12-12-582 | 13-1-639  |
| 11-9-304  | 12-1-733                                 | 12-5-1244 | 12-7-98  | 12-8-304  | 12-11-515 | 12-12-583 | 13-1-640  |
| 11-9-337  | 12-1-749                                 | 12-5-1246 | 12-7-111 | 12-9-336  | 12-11-516 | 12-12-584 | 13-1-642  |
| 11-9-343  | 12-1-764                                 | 12-5-1251 | 12-7-112 | 12-9-343  | 12-11-518 | 12-12-586 | 13-1-643  |
| 11-9-355  | 12-2-837                                 | 12-5-1259 | 12-7-129 | 12-9-346  | 12-11-519 | 12-12-590 | 13-1-646  |
| 11-9-358  | 12-2-838                                 | 12-5-1261 | 12-7-131 | 12-9-357  | 12-11-523 | 12-12-591 | 13-1-647  |
| 11-9-359  | 12-2-843                                 | 12-5-1266 | 12-7-153 | 12-9-358  | 12-11-524 | 12-12-592 | 13-1-648  |
| 11-9-392  | 12-2-854                                 | 12-5-1270 | 12-7-155 | 12-9-359  | 12-11-525 | 12-12-593 | 13-1-649  |
| 11-9-394  | 12-2-885                                 | 12-5-1280 | 12-7-167 | 12-9-363  | 12-11-529 | 12-12-594 | 13-1-650  |
| 11-9-396  | 12-2-891                                 | 12-6-1288 | 12-7-207 | 12-9-374  | 12-11-530 | 12-12-595 | 13-1-653  |
| 11-9-397  | 12-2-894                                 | 12-6-1290 | 12-7-211 | 12-10-413 | 12-11-531 | 12-12-597 | 13-1-655  |
| 11-9-398  | 12-2-896                                 | 12-6-1301 | 12-7-216 | 12-10-419 | 12-11-536 | 12-12-599 | 13-1-658  |
| 11-9-399  | 12-2-901                                 | 12-6-1305 | 12-7-218 | 12-10-425 | 12-11-537 | 12-12-600 | 13-1-663  |
| 11-9-401  | 12-3-942                                 | 12-6-1328 | 12-7-121 | 12-10-430 | 12-11-538 | 12-12-603 | 13-1-665  |
| 11-9-402  | 12-3-972                                 | 12-6-1329 | 12-8-227 | 12-10-432 | 12-11-539 | 12-12-606 | 13-1-668  |
| 11-9-418  | 12-3-974                                 | 12-6-1330 | 12-8-228 | 12-10-434 | 12-11-540 | 12-12-607 | 13-1-679  |
| 11-9-419  | 12-3-978                                 | 12-7-7    | 12-8-238 | 12-10-441 | 12-11-541 | 12-12-608 | 13-1-689  |
| 11-9-420  | 12-3-1026                                | 12-7-12   | 12-8-239 | 12-10-444 | 12-11-542 | 12-12-610 | 13-1-691  |
| 11-9-421  | 12-3-1031                                | 12-7-38   | 12-8-240 | 12-10-446 | 12-11-545 | 12-12-612 | 13-1-695  |
| 11-9-424  | 12-3-1032                                | 12-7-48   | 12-8-243 | 12-10-465 | 12-11-547 | 12-12-613 | 13-1-696  |
| 11-9-455  | 12-4-1120                                | 12-7-71   | 12-8-259 | 12-10-467 | 12-11-548 | 12-12-614 | 13-1-704  |
|           |  |           |          |           |           |           |           |

Page 7

### 11. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATION REPORT

The Educator Ethics Review Committee recommended to approve a no probable cause determination on 17 cases reflected on the *Applications for Certification Report*.

#### 12. FINAL DECISIONS BY OPERATION OF LAW

The Commission reviewed the report, which advised of 14 cases now closed without an appeal for a hearing before an Administrative Law Judge. The report also advised that there were 3 cases closed without an appeal for a review hearing before the Commission.

Vice Chair Bernath called for approval of the Educator Ethics Review Committee report as presented by Pam Walker excluding case # 12-11-512, 12-11-549, 12-11-508.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Abstention: Kami Luigs – 11-9-360, 11-9-391, 11-8-225, Dr. Adrian Epps – 12-8-281, Bettina Tate – 12—1295, 12-9-335

### **Probable Cause Case # 12-11-512**

**MOTION:** (Pam Walker / David Johnson) To Accept the EERC's recommendation of a Reprimand.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved Opposed: Kami Luigs, Phil Jacobs

### Probable Cause Case # 12-11-549

**MOTION:** (Pam Walker / Dr. Adrian Epps) To accept the EERC's recommendation of a 1 Year Suspenson.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

Opposed: Phil Jacobs, Kami Luigs, Christy McGill, Alice Clements

#### **Probable Cause Case # 12-11-508**

**MOTION:** (Kami Luigs / Phil Jacobs) To accept the EERC's recommendation of a Reprimand.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

#### **B.** Educator Preparation Standing Committee

Committee Chair, Dr. Adrian Epps, presented the report of the Educator Preparation Standing Committee.

|    | Unit<br>Number | April 2013 Detailed Approval Recommendations  | Additional Action Required   |
|----|----------------|---|--|
| 1. | 5270           | Preparation programs approval recommendations/decisions be tabled until the May 9, 2013, Educator Preparation Standing Committee meeting. |  |
| 2. | 8884           | Continuing Approval for the Georgia Teacher Academy for Preparation and Pedagogy (GaTAPP).  | A Progress Report addressing the Standard 2 area for improvement is due in six months. |

| Unit<br>Number | April 2013 Detailed Approval Recommendations   | Additional Action Required   |
|----------------|--|--|
|                | Change the Standard 2 Board of Examiners' finding for the Gifted In-Field Endorsement from Met to Not Met.   | The recommended change is due to the number and severity of the cited areas for improvement.   |
|                | Continuing Approval with Probation for the Gifted In-Field Endorsement.  | The education program provider is to complete a successful Probationary Review of the Education Program Provider and all educator preparation programs by Spring 2014. |
|                | No new candidates be admitted to the Gifted In-Field Endorsement program upon receipt of the official Georgia Professional Standards Commission decision letter. |  |

Vice Chair Bernath called for approval of the Educator Preparation Committee report as presented by Chair Epps.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved

# VIII. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

Vice Chair Bernath called for the meeting to be adjourned at 1:10 p.m.

**PSC ACTION:** Approved